

MEETING - ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS

CITY OF NOVI

TUESDAY, AUGUST 8, 2023 7:00 p.m.

Council Chambers | Novi Civic Center | 45175 W. Ten Mile Road

BOARD MEMBERS:

Joe Peddiboyina, Chairperson

Michael Longo, Secretary

Siddharth Mav Sanghvi

Clift Montague

Linda Krieger

Michael Longo

Michael Thompson

Jay McLeod

ALSO PRESENT:

Kristin Bricker Kolb, City Attorney

Alan Hall, Comm. Development, Dep. Director

Sarah Fletcher, Recording Secretary

Reported by:

Darlene K. May, Certified Shorthand Reporter

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

Novi, Michigan

Tuesday, August 8, 2023

7:00 p.m.

- - -

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Good evening.

Today is August 8th and today is Novi City Zoning Board of Appeals.

Call to the order.

Pledge of Allegiance. Please stand up all of you, followed by Michael Longo.

(Pledge of Allegiance recited.)

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so much.

Please be seated.

Roll call.

MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, Sarah.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

MEMBER LONGO: Here.

MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

MEMBER MCLEOD: Here.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

MEMBER MONTAGUE: Here.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

2 MEMBER KRIEGER: Here.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

4 MEMBER SANGHVI: Here.

5 MS. FLETCHER: MEMBER THOMPSON?

6 MEMBER THOMPSON: Here.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you,
8 Secretary.

9 And the public hearing format and Rules of
10 Conduct, you can get that one in the back. And today's
11 agenda. Please make your phones on silent mode so that
12 we have no distraction. Once the case calls you,
13 please come to the podium and you can speak and you can
14 present whatever you have.

15 If anybody wants to speak, also the public
16 hearing is allowed for only three minutes of time.

17 Okay. Thank you so much. I appreciate and
18 we have three cases. Before that, approval of agenda.
19 If somebody can make a motion?

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: I move to approve the agenda
21 as written.

22 MEMBER LONGO: I second.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. And

1 thank you, Thompson -- I'm sorry. Michael Longo.

2 And say "Aye" all in favor? Any changes or
3 anything?

4 MEMBER KRIEGER: In favor, Aye?

5 THE BOARD: Aye.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.
7 Any nays?

8 No. Thank you.

9 And minutes of July 2023? Somebody can make
10 a motion.

11 MEMBER KRIEGER: I move to accept the minutes
12 for July 2023.

13 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

15 Okay. Say all in favor "Aye."

16 THE BOARD: Aye.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Any nays?

18 Okay. Public remarks.

19 Anybody who would like to have any public
20 comments or anything you can keep put it -- you can
21 keep it on the agenda, if anybody wants to add
22 anything, this is the time where you can place your
23 public remarks.

1 Okay. Public hearings?

2 Okay. Looks like none. And we'll go for the
3 case number one today.

4 PZ23-0021, Brian Wilson, 24451 Christina
5 Lane, East of Taft Road, North of Ten Mile, Parcel
6 50-22-22-378-008. The applicant is requesting a use
7 variance from the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance Section
8 5.1.9 to allow parking of a commercial vehicle in a
9 residentially zoned property. This property is zoned
10 One Family Residential, R-4. This case was tabled from
11 the July 11th meeting.

12 Is the applicant present?

13 Okay. Please, spell your name clearly for
14 our secretary and for the court record. And they will
15 take the oath.

16 MR. WILSON: My name is Brian Wilson. That's
17 B-r-i-a-n, Wilson, W-i-l-s-o-n.

18 MEMBER LONGO: Are you a lawyer?

19 MR. WILSON: No.

20 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell the
21 truth in this case?

22 MR. WILSON: Yes.

23 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Brian,
2 please proceed where we can help you tonight on this
3 case. I know you came on July 11th meeting. And
4 please where we are standing of that previous month
5 meeting and what you are planning to issue on today's
6 meeting where we can help on the board. Thank you.

7 MR. WILSON: Yeah, that's correct. I was
8 here last month. An issue -- we postponed it to get
9 the truck weighed. The truck did come in overweight.
10 It was 6800 pounds naked, meaning no tools, no
11 equipment on the truck. With all that, it did come in
12 at 8200 pounds. So I'm asking for you guys to revisit
13 the issue and take the weight out of the equation.

14 Special circumstances: It's my only vehicle.
15 So it gets me around everywhere I need to go. I don't
16 have another vehicle. My wife does, but she also
17 works. So I'm asking that.

18 A couple of things that come to light. I did
19 mention the church parking lot last time I was here. I
20 have got everything the church needs in place from my
21 employer, if that is an option. They just wanted some
22 kind -- something on writing liability wise for my
23 truck to be parked in their lot, which I did receive

1 and submitted to the church. And they're okay with my
2 truck being parked in the church parking lot.

3 Option two, I don't know if this is a
4 loophole or something we can discuss is parking my
5 truck on the street. It's not private. It's a public
6 street. So I don't know if that makes a difference in
7 that variance or not. But I'm asking you guys to
8 consider that as well.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Brian,
10 anything else you want to add?

11 MR. WILSON: No.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. That's good.
13 And from the City?

14 MR. HALL: Thanks, Mr. Chairman.

15 Yeah. So we were -- postponed this meeting
16 to have the vehicle weighed and, obviously, it has come
17 in overweight. So that would be in violation of the
18 ordinance. We don't see the unique character that's
19 being displayed here for this residence. This could be
20 displayed in anybody's house, not just this one. The
21 approval tonight would be carrying to the lot and
22 that -- it's not a general approval, it's a specific
23 approval and there's no really unique factor saying it

1 needs to be this way.

2 So we don't look favorably on this approval.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you
4 from the City.

5 Correspondence, Secretary?

6 MEMBER LONGO: There were 38 mailings for
7 this. Four were returned. Two objections and one
8 approval. First objection is from Don Taylor, lives
9 across the street. He feels that having this -- this
10 vehicle's been here for over a year. He says, "I've
11 lived across the street in my house for 15 years and no
12 other large commercial vehicles with man lift and large
13 tool side boxes and so forth of Spectrum have littered
14 parking in our area."

15 The second one is: "I've lived a few doors
16 down from Brian and I've rarely spoken to him. I'm
17 assuming someone has complained about his work truck
18 being parked in the driveway. There are many ways --
19 there are many work vehicles in people's driveways in
20 that neighborhood. It seems to me that the variance
21 should be granted, if no other reason that the
22 environment -- that of environment protection." This
23 was from Bob Crump (phonetic).

1 And lastly is: "The truck parked at the
2 house is a large work truck with a cherry picker bucket
3 on the back not visible in the picture submitted in the
4 application. There used to be a van, Spectrum, parked
5 there. That is fine. The heavy equipment is not
6 acceptable. Ordinances are written as they are for a
7 reason. We shall not make an exception."

8 That was Kim and Marc Wagner.

9 That's it.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you so
11 much, Michael.

12 And any public hearing, anybody would like to
13 speak. This is the time where you can come onto the
14 podium and you can spell your first and last name and
15 your address for the secretary and you'll take the
16 oath, if you're not an attorney.

17 Yeah. Mr. Wilson, can you please step to the
18 side and he can come. Thank you.

19 MR. FORSYTH: Hi, my name is Doug Forsyth.
20 D-o-u-g, F-o-r-s-y-t-h.

21 There was actually -- I'm not a lawyer. I'm
22 actually Brian's direct neighbor. There was a fourth
23 approval. We actually had written in. It was actually

1 by my wife Kristin. We've lived next to Brian for a
2 couple of years now. I guess my stance is it's not an
3 eyesore by any means. And my claim is just as a
4 person. I mean, he's trying to raise a family, you
5 know what I mean? You guys are kind of, by not
6 approving this, forcing him to go purchase a vehicle
7 and do all these things when he's just trying to put
8 food on the table. That's how he gets to and from
9 work.

10 You know, so just from my perspective, being
11 a family man, that's what he's trying to do with what
12 he's doing. So that's my stance. It's not an eyesore.
13 It's not a problem to us. And we're literally 20 feet
14 from his driveway. It's not a hindrance to anything.
15 So, that's all.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

17 Anybody on this case would like to speak,
18 this is the time where you can.

19 Okay. Looks like none.

20 It's open to the board.

21 Dr. Sanghvi, please go ahead.

22 MEMBER SANGHVI: Mr. Chair?

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, please.

1 MEMBER SANGHVI: We went -- I went and saw
2 this place. I have seen this parked in the parking lot
3 and all that. But that's not the issue. My biggest
4 question here to the City and the attorney both, if he
5 parks it on the street, what happens? Instead of his
6 driveway. Then he's not breaking any ordinance.

7 MS. KOLB: I'm going to play a little bit
8 dumb because I am filling in for the regular attorney,
9 but I am not aware of any prohibition parking a vehicle
10 on a public street. Now, I have not read your entire
11 code. There may be something in there I'm just simply
12 not aware of. But if it's a public street, it's
13 possible there's no --

14 MEMBER SANGHVI: In my subdivision just
15 across from where I live on the other side, there is a
16 van parked of a plumber and he lives there and he's on
17 call. And he has to go anytime, especially in winter
18 and other times. And so long as he doesn't park in his
19 driveway, he's not breaking any ordinance. He's on the
20 street.

21 And this is really a philosophical issue as
22 well as compassionate issue. What do you do with them,
23 tell them to park it on the street instead of their

1 driveway?

2 MR. HALL: If I could answer your question,
3 sir. I guess the decision would be where would you
4 draw the line? This is an ordinance question and this
5 would be a higher value for it. So if everybody parked
6 in the street and became a hazard for fire equipment to
7 go through, that would be a different story all
8 together. So we would have to look at that in terms of
9 the City and we'd have to research that. So we
10 couldn't make a decision today.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: There is something wrong
12 with the ordinance if you're parked in your own
13 driveway, you are breaking the law. If you are not and
14 put it on the street, the same thing just on the other
15 side, you are doing okay. It doesn't add up to any
16 common sense.

17 And I think sometimes we have to let common
18 sense rule the road rather than -- that is why they
19 used to say in England, that the law is in us
20 sometimes.

21 And also, I can say what my father was an
22 appellant attorney and I used to do a lot of legal
23 reading for him because he was getting catching. This

1 was over 70 years ago.

2 And he used to tell me, "Mav, the lady
3 justice is blindfolded, but the scales of justice must
4 be tempered with must see."

5 And we need to think in a little different
6 way in a situation like this, even though it is not
7 acceptable. Economic hardship is not a hardship and
8 all kinds of things. But we want to think hard about
9 it before declining him his livelihood by telling him
10 he can't keep it there.

11 He can keep it on the street, that's fine.
12 And I can't officially tell him, though, you keep it on
13 the street, you're not breaking any ordinance. So
14 please think about it before you take any decision.

15 Thank you.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
17 Dr. Sanghvi.

18 Any other board member would like to speak on
19 this case, please?

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: A question also.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Go ahead,
22 Linda.

23 MEMBER KRIEGER: So for us if we deny it,

1 it's because of the weight solely of the vehicle?

2 MR. HALL: Yeah. There's a number of items,
3 but that's what kicks the ordinance in. It's a
4 commercial vehicle on a driveway within a residential
5 district.

6 So the threshold is the weight. It goes over
7 that so it's within the ordinance.

8 MEMBER KRIEGER: Oh, so if I bought a semi
9 truck, I couldn't park it in my driveway?

10 MR. HALL: If it was a vehicle, like a
11 commercial vehicle, yeah.

12 MEMBER KRIEGER: Oh my goodness. I never
13 thought of that.

14 Then also, he's renting -- I believe that's
15 right --

16 MR. WILSON: Correct.

17 MEMBER KRIEGER: -- from last time. So it's
18 okay -- do you have a written documentation for -- that
19 you can park that vehicle on that driveway?

20 MR. WILSON: Yeah. I believe actually my
21 landlord did submit something to the City.

22 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. I don't remember
23 seeing it.

1 And then also, yeah, if we deny him, then he
2 could park it in the street without any issues?

3 MR. HALL: We would have to check into that.
4 I'm not exactly sure if that's true or not because
5 there's a path of travel through the street. I don't
6 know what that was.

7 MEMBER KRIEGER: So that would be a future
8 tabling then, maybe.

9 And then also, the -- if we approved it, it
10 would be for this property only or others would come
11 and is that the concern?

12 MS. KOLB: Use variances are specific to the
13 property.

14 MEMBER KRIEGER: So any -- this particular --
15 if we approve it, it will be any property for any -- I
16 mean, this property for any amount of time?

17 MS. KOLB: Correct. Use variances run with
18 the land. Which would mean the future owner could park
19 a commercial vehicle there as well.

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: And you also stated that the
21 church is giving you permission?

22 MR. WILSON: They have.

23 MEMBER KRIEGER: So you would be willing to

1 go with that?

2 MR. WILSON: Correct.

3 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. That's all my
4 questions.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Member
6 Linda.

7 Okay. Go ahead, Member Montague.

8 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yeah. It's an unusual
9 case. We're here to rule on a variance and economics
10 cannot be the reason that we give a variance. That's
11 the facts and that's where we are. I was hoping you
12 would come in under -- we talked last time -- under the
13 8,000. But the church to me has been there seems like
14 a pretty good option. It's right next door to your
15 property.

16 MR. WILSON: Right.

17 MEMBER MONTAGUE: So it's not like we're
18 going to make you walk a mile or a half a mile.

19 MR. WILSON: Right.

20 MEMBER MONTAGUE: So, again, I'm going to be
21 voting for not giving the variance and would recommend
22 you use the church.

23 MR. WILSON: So is that an option? Is that

1 something I can do with not --

2 MEMBER MONTAGUE: You've got permission from
3 the church. So ...

4 MR. WILSON: So I don't need any approval --

5 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah. If we deny then,
6 yeah, then your option is the church or as Mr. -- our
7 other member said, you can park it in the street.

8 MR. WILSON: Okay.

9 MEMBER KRIEGER: Which that's the new
10 quandary is, I mean, if it was me, I would park in the
11 street then and then it becomes an issue. So I'd
12 rather it be a friendly win-win situation. So if you
13 could go along with the church avenue and then have it
14 parked in there and work out something with them, that
15 would be great for the overall --

16 MR. WILSON: I would be more than happy to
17 take that avenue.

18 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. Is there anything we
19 can do so we don't approve or deny that and just let
20 him do what he's planning on doing?

21 MR. HALL: We have some further information
22 about the street.

23 MEMBER KRIEGER: All right. Cool.

1 MS. KOLB: So in the code outside of the
2 zoning ordinance in the regular city code there is
3 prohibition against parking commercial vehicles in
4 excess of 5,000 pounds on the street. So that is
5 something the police would write a ticket for. That
6 would not be enforced by code enforcement.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: What is the weight
8 you mentioned, 6,000 or something?

9 MR. WILSON: No. It's 8200 with all my tools
10 and everything on it.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: After removing your
12 tools, what is the --

13 MR. WILSON: 6800.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: 6800. You're
15 saying that 5,000, no?

16 MS. KOLB: That's under the code, yes. In
17 excess of 5,000 pounds cannot be parked on the city
18 street.

19 MEMBER KRIEGER: For how long?

20 MS. KOLB: Ever.

21 MR. HALL: Any time.

22 MEMBER KRIEGER: Half hour?

23 MS. KOLB: Except for unloading.

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay.

2 MS. KOLB: Except for loading and
3 unloading.

4 MR. WILSON: I mean, I would be more than
5 happy to park in the church anyway over the street.

6 So if that's a solution to this problem, then
7 that would be great for me.

8 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay.

9 MEMBER McLEOD: The only thing I would like
10 to add is the weight restriction on driveways does
11 exist for a reason. The cement used for a driveway,
12 the cement used for a sidewalk is not made for heavy
13 vehicles driving on it. The grade is definitely
14 different than a street or say a highway. So there's a
15 legitimate reason for weight limits on cement. It will
16 eventually crack and break. Especially if it was
17 sitting on a sidewalk, if there's a sidewalk out there.

18 So it's not because we're trying to be, you
19 know, cruel. It's there because it will eventually
20 destroy the pavement far faster than normal residential
21 vehicle.

22 MR. WILSON: So it's never on the sidewalk.
23 Obviously, I've got to drive over the sidewalk to get

1 into my driveway, but it's never across the sidewalk.

2 I'm assuming if I did damage to my driveway,
3 that's -- that would be my responsibility and not
4 anybody else's.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

6 MEMBER LONGO: Yeah. I have a question for
7 Alan.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, Michael
9 Longo.

10 MEMBER LONGO: He's considering parking in
11 the church's parking lot. Doesn't -- isn't there an
12 ordinance that he can't park there either?

13 MR. HALL: That's what we're looking up right
14 now.

15 MEMBER LONGO: Okay.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. About to ask
17 the same question.

18 MEMBER LONGO: I would think they would be
19 the same ordinance.

20 MR. HALL: It would be the same ordinance and
21 it's in a residential district so we're trying to
22 see --

23 MEMBER LONGO: I mean, I don't want to give

1 him an idea if it's something he shouldn't be doing.

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Once we give
3 an option --

4 MR. HALL: So it would be the same -- using
5 the church is the same zoning district as the houses in
6 that area with a special use approval.

7 We're trying to look it up right now, but I'm
8 thinking you're correct. I think that would be the
9 same ordinance.

10 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Let's wait
12 for the attorney while she speaks on this case.

13 Anybody who would like to speak on this case
14 on the board members?

15 Yeah, Michael Thompson?

16 MEMBER THOMPSON: One of your neighbors had
17 said that, like, previously you had a van there?

18 MR. WILSON: Yeah. So I used to have a -- an
19 actual just a regular full size van without the picker
20 on the back. So I'm assuming that's what they're
21 referring to.

22 MEMBER THOMPSON: Is there a chance like
23 vehicles would be changed out?

1 MR. WILSON: No. This is a -- I got a
2 promotion so this is a new position for me, which
3 requires me to have the actual bucket on the back of
4 the truck. So the biggest issue is that on call, like
5 we talked about previously, without allowing my vehicle
6 to be where I have access to it 24/7, I lose that
7 ability to be on call. That's the biggest hiccup for
8 me. Obviously, other than having to go buy another
9 car, but I'm losing so much income, which I know that
10 doesn't factor into this decision or not.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, Mr. City.

12 MR. HALL: Some information.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, please go
14 ahead.

15 MR. HALL: So the church is in the exact same
16 zoning district as the home.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Oh. Okay. Anybody
18 would like to say or make a motion?

19 Jay, you want to say. Okay.

20 MEMBER McLEOD: Just to confirm, if the
21 church should be in the same exact position as the
22 home, does that mean he would need to come back again
23 to park in the church or the rejection here would just

1 be rejecting all of it?

2 MR. HALL: The weight limit kicks the
3 ordinance in.

4 MEMBER McLEOD: Oh, the weight limit. I see.

5 MR. HALL: And so that the church would fall
6 in the same as the driveway. It's the zoning is the
7 trick. Not a house thing, it's a zoning thing. So the
8 church would fall in the same zoning district.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

10 MEMBER THOMPSON: So a question on that. I
11 have some commercial real estate. And the church
12 parking lot is owned and maintained by the church.

13 MR. HALL: Correct.

14 MEMBER THOMPSON: Wouldn't that fall under
15 something different 'cause it's their parking lot?

16 MR. HALL: No. 'Cause it's their zoning
17 district, but they got a special use. All churches get
18 a special use to be in a zoning district. They can go
19 any zoning district. So they get a special use to put
20 a church there. So they would still be under the rules
21 of that zoning district.

22 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. I know the
23 commercial stuff I have, like, a church's could be

1 considered like a heavy use parking lot. All the
2 people coming in and out and maintenance vehicles
3 similar to this one coming in and out, I would assume
4 that the church parking lot was poured thick enough
5 where a commercial vehicle driving over it is not going
6 to affect it.

7 MR. HALL: That would have to be determined.
8 So if that was the case and they had, you know, some
9 kind of writing or something of that nature we could
10 look at it, like he's looking at this case. We would
11 look at the same case in the church's property if the
12 church wanted to get that variance.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Go ahead,
14 Clift Montague.

15 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Could we -- are we then
16 just supposed to -- would we just deny this or could we
17 pass that he could park in the church parking lot as a
18 variance?

19 MS. KOLB: It's a separate property with a
20 different owner. So the owner of that property would
21 have to apply separately for the variance.

22 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Okay.

23 MS. KOLB: He cannot request a variance on

1 behalf of a different parcel owner.

2 MR. WILSON: But I did for -- I'm renting my
3 house and I was able to apply for a variance for the
4 house I live in which I'm not the owner. And there was
5 a box or something that I had to fill out stating that
6 and that was okay with --

7 MS. FLETCHER: The homeowner signed off on
8 it.

9 MS. KOLB: Right. So either way the ZBA
10 tonight cannot make a motion to approve you to park on
11 the church parking lot. You would have to submit a
12 separate application.

13 MR. WILSON: But I can submit that, not
14 the -- the church does not have to submit that?

15 MS. KOLB: In the case of the property you're
16 a tenant and you live there full time. That's a little
17 different than --

18 MEMBER MONTAGUE: The church.

19 MS. KOLB: Yeah, than the -- you know.

20 MR. WILSON: I mean, if I have approval from
21 the church, that doesn't --

22 MS. KOLB: They would have to sign off on the
23 application.

1 MR. WILSON: Yeah, I understand. I
2 understand that.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Yeah, Member
4 Thompson?

5 MEMBER THOMPSON: Are we able to table this
6 until he applies for the church one?

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: No. We are not
8 going to table this. He has to come up with the other
9 option. Attorney mentioned that the church has to come
10 in a different application.

11 MEMBER KRIEGER: Why can't we table it?

12 MR. HALL: Because it's a different property.

13 MEMBER KRIEGER: Oh.

14 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, that's a
15 different property. I can't table that one. Because I
16 already did that last month.

17 MEMBER KRIEGER: Sorry. Thank you.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. And please,
19 Linda, can you make a motion, please?

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: Okay. In case number
21 PZ23-0021, I move that we deny the variance request for
22 this property because the petitioner has not
23 established a necessary hardship related to the current

1 zoning designation of the property in the subdivision
2 because it's a residential area with weight limits.

3 The petitioner has not established unique
4 circumstances or unique physical conditions regarding
5 to this specific property in a residential area
6 compared to others related to commercial vehicles on
7 private property. The various request is based on
8 petitioner's personal or economic hardship because
9 petitioner is leasing the property from the property
10 owner.

11 The property use will alternate the essential
12 character of the area with the commercial vehicle in a
13 residential area. And the petitioner has created the
14 need for the variance by a commercial vehicle in a
15 residential area.

16 MEMBER LONGO: I second that.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

18 Please roll call.

19 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

21 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

22 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

MEMBER SANGHVI: No.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

MEMBER THOMPSON: No.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Motion passes.

MEMBER KRIEGER: I'll see you at the church.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you so much.

MR. WILSON: What do you mean, I'll see you at the church?

MEMBER KRIEGER: If you want to come back -- if you'll have the church people come back and --

MR. WILSON: Okay. So, I guess, can I ask for an extension or some kind of time frame on when I would have to have that truck out of my parking -- out of my driveway? You know, there's a lot of hoops I got to jump through right now with work and then, obviously, to buy another vehicle.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: No. Once we --

2 MS. KOLB: Yeah. It's effective immediately.

3 So ...

4 MEMBER KRIEGER: He's had it there for a
5 year, though, according to the residents. So ...

6 MR. WILSON: I've been in Novi for eight
7 years.

8 MR. HALL: I mean, usually when a decision is
9 made, it's immediate. It would have to be -- I don't
10 know if you can make a motion on that. I think it's
11 immediate action, so.

12 MS. KOLB: I think that's an issue for him to
13 work out with code enforcement.

14 MR. HALL: Yeah. Have you been ticketed
15 lately or no?

16 MR. WILSON: Just that brought this into
17 light.

18 MR. HALL: Just the one. Yeah, yeah.

19 MEMBER McLEOD: I'm no lawyer, but if he were
20 to start parking at the church, I think that would
21 reset a different clock.

22 MS. KOLB: It's a different location. So I
23 guess, yes.

1 MR. HALL: I can't comment on that.

2 MEMBER KRIEGER: And you have the paperwork.

3 So ...

4 MR. WILSON: It's already filled out and
5 submitted.

6 MEMBER KRIEGER: Very good.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Today's case
8 two -- number two, PZ23-0024, Motor City Hot Tubs,
9 25806 Novi Road, East of Novi Road, South of Grand
10 River Avenue, Parcel 50-22-23-151-004. The applicant
11 is requesting variance from the Sign Design and Review
12 Manual of city TC-1 District to allow a non-conforming
13 sign design style, translucent internally, of the Novi
14 TC-1 District to allow a non-conforming sign design
15 style, translucent internally illuminated signs are
16 prohibited.

17 The applicant is also requesting a variance
18 from the City of Novi Sign Ordinance Section
19 28-5(e)(1)a to allow a 13.67 square foot sign. The
20 maximum allowed area is six square feet, a variance
21 ever 7.67 square feet.

22 Section 28-5(e)(1)b to allow the placement of
23 the sign at eight feet from the grade, the minimum is

1 8.5 feet, a variance of point five feet. And also
2 height of 14.83 feet from the grade, the maximum
3 allowed height of 12 feet, a variance of 2.83 feet.
4 This property is zoned Town Center-1, TC-1.

5 Please go ahead and spell your first and last
6 name clearly for our court record and if you're not an
7 attorney, please take the oath from our secretary.

8 MR. DEMPSTER: Good evening. My name is
9 Robert Dempster from Dempster Designs. R-o-b-e-r-t,
10 D-e-m-p-s-t-e-r.

11 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney?

12 MR. DEMPSTER: No, no.

13 MEMBER LONGO: Then do you promise to tell
14 the truth in this case?

15 MR. DEMPSTER: Absolutely.

16 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. And you
18 also, please, going to.

19 MR. NAGEL: John Nagel, from Image 360.
20 That's J-o-h-n, N-a-g-e-l.

21 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney?

22 MR. NAGEL: No.

23 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell the

1 truth in this case?

2 MR. NAGEL: Yes.

3 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

4 THE COURT: Okay. Who wants to speak first
5 and please go ahead where we can help you tonight on
6 this board.

7 MR. DEMPSTER: Okay. Good evening. What we
8 are seeking is approval and a variance on the hot tub
9 signs, the Motor City Hot Tub signs which is right at
10 Novi Road and Grand River.

11 MR. NAGEL: Main Street.

12 MR. DEMPSTER: Oh, Main Street. Yeah, Main
13 Street. That's right. It's on Main Street. We've
14 been doing the signs there for years and Ace Cutting
15 was in there and now there's Motor City Hot Tubs.

16 So we fabricated a projecting sign. And I
17 think we are -- if I'm correct, we are below the
18 maximum square foot area, correct?

19 MR. NAGEL: The square foot area that's
20 allowed for that building is 24 square feet. However,
21 in a projecting wall sign, our overall area with the
22 rectangle around it is 14 square feet and we're
23 requesting a variance on that as well because of the

1 six foot allowance on a projecting wall sign.

2 MR. DEMPSTER: Our Ace Cutting sign, if I
3 may, it was projecting before. It was a V'd
4 (phonetic)? Did anybody ever see that right there at
5 the building? It was projecting. So when we applied
6 for this permitting, we did not know that we could not
7 have a projecting sign. And we've done a lot in the
8 signage prior to this.

9 MR. NAGEL: TC-1.

10 MR. DEMPSTER: TC-1?

11 MR. NAGEL: Um-hmm.

12 MR. DEMPSTER: There are a lot of flat signs
13 and there were -- there are currently projecting signs.
14 So we did not know this was going to be any problem.
15 The customer requested a projecting sign and I think
16 it's a good idea because of the -- there's somewhat of
17 a hardship there because if you're driving, you can't
18 really -- you really don't know what the building is.
19 And if possible, I would like to put -- add a few more
20 things to the wall -- or some ideas that could be
21 creative so the retailer could -- it's really a hard
22 corner. So the projecting sign which they requested,
23 we did not know that would even be a problem.

1 MR. NAGEL: Correct. At the time of design
2 for it, I had stopped into the building department with
3 this design, discussed with one of the building
4 officials. And it -- I believe at that time they
5 didn't realize that it was in the TC-1 district which
6 does not allow a projecting wall -- well, let's back
7 up.

8 In the TC-1 district you're allowed
9 projecting signs, but there is not a written that we
10 could find that states the size. So we designed this
11 to be well below the existing sign that was there from
12 Ace which was 20 square feet total, and well below the
13 Mongolian Barbecue which is around 75 square feet
14 projecting. And there was a few others, the old beer
15 sign that was there that was done years ago.

16 So I'm just trying to explain how we got to
17 the design and the size and where we're at today with
18 this.

19 MR. DEMPSTER: And you -- the commission
20 has --

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. You can
22 place it on the projector so that we can see them.

23 MR. DEMPSTER: Oh, here?

1 (Holding up sign.)

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: No, no.

3 MR. NAGEL: This right here.

4 MR. DEMPSTER: Oh.

5 (Document displayed.)

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah.

7 MR. DEMPSTER: This is like an existing sign
8 here, which is quite large. It's larger. We never
9 thought there to be any problems. So we're looking for
10 a little bit of compassion. The retailer does need
11 help. Every time I go in there, he needs more sales,
12 so. The sign is small really for the building. And so
13 we're looking -- seeking approval that we could
14 continue to keep that sign.

15 For what it's worth, we have the flat signs I
16 did Bi Bim Bab years ago. I think 20 years ago. So
17 the projecting sign we can see both ways there on Novi
18 Road. So that's why we're here tonight.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Do you have the
20 sign? If you can present on that, the new one what
21 you're looking.

22 (Document displayed.)

23 MR. DEMPSTER: Now, that's a close up, but we

1 can -- can you show another view where you can see the
2 scale? Like there. Okay. That one's better.

3 MR. NAGEL: Yes.

4 (Document displayed.)

5 MR. DEMPSTER: You see that's pretty much in
6 scale. And that's not a large sign. It's, you know,
7 no problem with the easement and --

8 MR. NAGEL: The sidewalk is 10 feet from the
9 building. So we have a 10-foot area. The sign only
10 projects three feet off the building. It's 84 inches
11 tall. The dome centered is 24 inches. I can -- let me
12 show you that.

13 (Document displayed.)

14 MR. NAGEL: Here's all the physical
15 dimensions.

16 MR. DEMPSTER: Yeah. It's 82 inches tall,
17 which is --

18 MR. NAGEL: 83 inches tall, yeah.

19 MR. DEMPSTER: Yeah. And the customer, he's
20 done a lot to the landscaping there. He's made it
21 beautiful. So he's really improved the area. So this
22 is somebody that cares about Novi. Cares about
23 business. And super appreciative if you consider, you

1 know, approving this.

2 MR. NAGEL: The overall face of the sign is
3 eight square feet.

4 So the surface of the sign is eight square
5 feet. But with the ordinance being the way it is, you
6 draw a box around it, that's how we get to the 13.67
7 square feet. Like I said, when you go to the Mongolian
8 Barbecue, which that sign is on the Main Street, in the
9 walking district where cars are going by 20 miles an
10 hour, 25, people are walking. That's a 72 square foot
11 sign that is projecting. This is -- we went as minimal
12 as we can to keep costs down for the customer and get
13 visibility for the customer.

14 So this is an area, again, Novi Road. That
15 building is kind of on the corner. It's missed even
16 though there's a light there. And traffic's going by
17 35 to 55 miles an hour, depending on the time of the
18 day. So that's why -- another reason why we went with
19 the double-sided sign as opposed to a flat wall sign.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anything you
21 would like to add before going to?

22 MR. DEMPSTER: No.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

1 MR. DEMPSTER: Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Robert.

3 From the City?

4 MR. HALL: Thank you, Mr. Chairman. Yes, the
5 sign is already installed without a permit. It is
6 residing into TC-1 district, which they mentioned.
7 Being in a district, they are design sign ordinance
8 correct. You got to abide by it and also, we have to
9 abide by the sign design review manual for the TC-1
10 district. So there's an overlay of more standards that
11 have to be applied to the sign. In that it has a size
12 variance and that kind of stuff. They're asking for
13 four separate variances tonight. But the TC-1 district
14 according to the sign design review manual doesn't
15 allow for internally lit signs. They're prohibited.
16 This sign is internally lit. So they'll be asking for
17 that variance also.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

19 Okay. Correspondence, Secretary?

20 MEMBER LONGO: Yes. There were 15 of these
21 mailed out. Two were returned. No objections and no
22 approvals.

23 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,

1 Secretary.

2 Okay. Anybody in the audience, public, would
3 like to speak on this case? This is the time where you
4 can speak.

5 Okay. Looks like none. Okay. It's open to
6 the board. Dr. Sanghvi.

7 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. Hi.

8 MR. DEMPSTER: Hi.

9 MEMBER SANGHVI: I came and looked at your
10 sign. How long have you had that sign there?

11 MR. NAGEL: About six weeks.

12 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yeah. Did you realize that
13 you needed a variance before you put the sign there?

14 MR. NAGEL: No. There was a -- it was a
15 combination of some mishaps within my business.

16 MEMBER SANGHVI: It's a simple yes or no.

17 MR. NAGEL: Oh, no. No. Okay. The answer
18 is no, we did not realize we needed a variance before
19 the sign. The permit application had already been
20 submitted with the city. We were waiting on approval
21 from the city. When I came into the building
22 department, I sat down with the permit, went over the
23 design with them, discussed it. When I left the

1 building and the discussion I had with them, I had no
2 idea or was under no impression because they said this
3 is fine. It looks like it's just got to go through the
4 process. I said great. Thank you. And I left.

5 MEMBER SANGHVI: And you've been putting
6 signs in the city before?

7 MR. NAGEL: I've put several signs in the
8 city before. This has never happened to me, yes.

9 MEMBER SANGHVI: You know what the ordinance
10 is?

11 MR. NAGEL: I know exactly what your
12 ordinances are in the general district. The TC-1 has
13 got its own ordinance, its own separate design. And
14 everything is -- varies. If you look at the next
15 picture I just put up, these are all TC-1 -- those --
16 all of those signs are internally lit.

17 MEMBER SANGHVI: In spite of everything, you
18 do it and then you make the sign and put it there even
19 though.

20 MR. NAGEL: That was -- I can explain that.
21 That was a mistake within my permit department and my
22 production. Permitting department thought the sign was
23 approved and stamped, sent it to production and

1 install. That one slipped by me. I'm the owner of the
2 company. I have multiple departments, multiple people,
3 so it got through. This is the first time it's
4 happened to me in 33 years that anything got built
5 prior to approval and installation.

6 So I already talked to Debra (phonetic) at
7 the building and begged for forgiveness and she said,
8 John, here's what -- here's your plan of attack. Go
9 get a variance before we make you take it down or
10 before we fine you. So she gave me the opportunity to
11 present it because in her mind I guess she felt that
12 this was a nice looking sign. We made a mistake.
13 Let's fix it.

14 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I have nothing
15 further.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Dr.
17 Sanghvi.

18 Also, I'm not happy that you're a
19 professional -- you're a professional sign business and
20 you know what to do and you need to take the ordinance
21 and all those things.

22 And also, you already installed also, then
23 you applied for the permit. Okay. I'm also not happy

1 on that.

2 Anybody would like to speak, on the board?

3 Okay. Member Thompson?

4 MEMBER THOMPSON: What is the speed limit?

5 You mentioned that the going is 20 or 25. What is the
6 speed limit going by that? 45?

7 MR. NAGEL: It's 45 on Grand River, yes.

8 MR. DEMPSTER: On Novi.

9 MR. NAGEL: On Novi Road. Sorry. On Novi
10 Road, yes. Yeah. I just drove it.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: The speed limit?

12 MR. DEMPSTER: The speed limit going by the
13 sign.

14 MR. NAGEL: It's going by fast.

15 MR. DEMPSTER: On the street going by the
16 sign.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: On Grand River? On
18 Novi --

19 MEMBER MONTAGUE: On Novi.

20 MR. NAGEL: On Novi Road.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: On Novi Road it's
22 45.

23 Okay. Linda?

1 MEMBER KRIEGER: On Main Street how would --
2 the TC is on Main Street. So they -- I was here -- I
3 was not here before the Mongolian Barbecue got their
4 sign. So they can be because they're on Main Street
5 versus Novi Road or it was from variances?

6 MR. HALL: I don't know. I don't know
7 either. I'm sorry. We can look that up for you. I'm
8 not sure.

9 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah, because it's a
10 different location, but then they're still in the same
11 district which when it said the TC, Town Center, I was
12 thinking north of Grand River.

13 So when I was looking for the building, I
14 came across it. I was looking for the numbers and
15 that's how I found it versus the sign. Because I don't
16 usually go out at night so I don't pay attention to
17 what's lit up at night except that it preferred that
18 things not be lit up to decrease light pollution.

19 And also, I had a question about on the south
20 side, is there also a sign?

21 MR. DEMPSTER: No.

22 MR. NAGEL: No.

23 MEMBER KRIEGER: So this would just be the

1 sign you want -- the only sign on the property?

2 MR. NAGEL: Right.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: On the Novi Road.

4 MEMBER: Main Street.

5 MEMBER: There's a big sign in the parking
6 lot as is.

7 MEMBER KRIEGER: No. They're on Novi Road.

8 MEMBER MONTAGUE: No. This is facing Novi
9 Road.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Facing Novi Road.

11 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yeah. This is Novi, yeah.

12 MR. NAGEL: Right. This is Novi Road.

13 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yeah. The picture is from
14 Main Street but the sign that you want is on Novi Road
15 and lit from -- they don't want lit the -- they have a
16 reason for it not to be in that regard.

17 So I'd like to hear from the rest of my team.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

19 Mr. Montague?

20 MEMBER MONTAGUE: What are the hours of the
21 store?

22 MR. DEMPSTER: I think 10 a.m. to 8:00.

23 MR. NAGEL: That sounds right.

1 MR. DEMPSTER: 10 a.m. to 8:00.

2 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Ergo then the want for the
3 illumination for the -- it is in a bad spot in terms of
4 visibility for sure.

5 MR. NAGEL: Right. I mean, that's --

6 MEMBER MONTAGUE: That's a corner. And
7 actually, quite honestly the sign is not that evident
8 when you go by. It is pretty small in relation to the
9 building. So it is a bad spot. I have to reiterate,
10 the sign being up before coming here is a huge negative
11 and that does not make any of us happy.

12 MR. NAGEL: That is totally on me, like I
13 said.

14 And, again, 33 years in the business. First
15 time it's happened and, you know, I begged for
16 forgiveness with Debra. She's helping me out. But I'm
17 really begging for my customer. I hate to have my
18 mistake fall back on them. Because regardless of
19 anything, I would be here today because I believe this
20 is the best option for the customer.

21 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Well, I agree there's a
22 hardship in terms of the location and locating that.
23 'Cause even knowing where it was, as I went by, I'm

1 like, wow, that's a pretty -- that's pretty
2 unobtrusive. That's pretty small.

3 MR. DEMPSTER: Thank you. Another part of
4 this is, I'm also -- I own retail businesses and that's
5 a very hard -- I'd like to do more if I could. We're
6 at this point, but maybe we can readdress it and help
7 the customer be successful there. He's got some
8 beautiful hot tubs. But the signage and the way it
9 looks doesn't show it.

10 So there you go. I mean, this guy's trying
11 to make it happen there and he's committed to the city.
12 He's a great person to have. And this came up and
13 we're looking for compassion on this one, guys and
14 gals, so it can --

15 MEMBER MONTAGUE: One other thing I would
16 like to say, there is a banner on the side of the
17 building. So ...

18 MR. DEMPSTER: There's a banner, but we're
19 going to remove that. We did not put that there.

20 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I'm just saying --

21 MR. NAGEL: That's coming down.

22 MEMBER MONTAGUE: -- there was another
23 signage. That needs to come down. That is another

1 sign.

2 MR. NAGEL: It was going to coming down the
3 second this -- yeah. That's coming down.

4 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I was there today and it
5 was still there. So that also is not acceptable.

6 MR. NAGEL: Not a problem.

7 MR. DEMPSTER: That will come down
8 immediately. We had nothing to do with that, but we
9 know -- we understand that. We want to take that down.

10 MEMBER MONTAGUE: All right. Thank you.

11 MEMBER McLEOD: And I can understand the
12 concern about the light pollution from that, but when
13 you look at where they're located, there really aren't
14 that many -- or any residents there. The ones that are
15 there are not likely to complain from the cemetery
16 where it would have the direct view of the sign.

17 So I don't think it's going to actually
18 disrupt any individuals from -- at night.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. So Novi
20 city is the best city in the country, and we always
21 increase the businesses also. We do our best for the
22 city and also revenue. We're not saying that, but we
23 need to follow any guidelines. That's all we want.

1 And also, my fellow board member also mentioned, it's
2 not residential. It's opposite a cemetery also. No
3 residential in that area.

4 So, yeah, that's all I wanted to say. And
5 anybody would like to speak on this?

6 Okay. None.

7 Please, Montague. Member Montague. Or
8 sorry. Member Thompson.

9 There is four, I think, motions, am I right,
10 City?

11 MR. HALL: I didn't hear the question?

12 MS. FLETCHER: Does he want separate motions?

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: These are separate
14 motions or how you want to?

15 MR. HALL: I think you have to do separate
16 motions for each one.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Attorney?

18 MR. HALL: You have to do a separate motion
19 for each variance. There's four of them.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Each variance?
21 Okay. Mr. Michael Thompson, please proceed for four
22 motions on this case.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. I move that we grant

1 the variance in case PZ23-0024 sought by Motor City Hot
2 Tubs for a sign variance because the petitioner has
3 shown practical difficulty including a hardship,
4 requiring a sign on the basis of any of the following:
5 The failure to grant relief will unreasonable prevent
6 or limit the use of the property and will result in
7 substantially more than a mere inconvenience or
8 inability to obtain a higher economic or financial
9 return just because the location of the sign. And the
10 speed limit being, you know, 45 miles an hour where it
11 is.

12 I also feel that it's in a good spot compared
13 to its local businesses.

14 I've never done four variances.

15 MEMBER LONGO: Repeat the thing four times
16 with the different variances basically.

17 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. So that would be for
18 PZ23-0024, like, number one?

19 MR. HALL: Yeah. The signs --

20 MS. FLETCHER: Say it --

21 MS. KOLB: I was going to say, can you
22 identify exactly what that is?

23 (Pause.)

1 MS. KOLB: Yeah. The ordinance sections are
2 all in there, so.

3 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. So that would be for
4 the sign ordinance, Section 28-5 to allow a 13.67
5 square foot sign. The variance of 7.67.

6 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I'd like to add to your
7 motion on the condition that that banner come down on
8 the building that's there now.

9 MEMBER THOMPSON: Do I have to say that or is
10 that good?

11 MS. KOLB: If you agree just --

12 MEMBER THOMPSON: I agree.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, you agree.
14 Make sure that PZ23-0024 on this case, four motions by
15 Michael Thompson and he's agreed. Am I right?

16 MS. KOLB: That was one motion.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. One motion.
18 Oh, that's one motion.

19 MS. KOLB: That was the first variance.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

21 MEMBER THOMPSON: That was number one.

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah.

23 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. Number two, I move

1 that we grant the variance in case number PZ23-0024 --

2 MS. FLETCHER: Yeah. Wait.

3 MEMBER KRIEGER: I'm sorry. Can we do one at
4 a time and vote on it one at a time?

5 MS. KOLB: We need a second for that motion
6 and then a vote. And then a motion --

7 MEMBER KRIEGER: Right. So, Clift, and you
8 second that --

9 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I will second that motion.
10 Yes, I'll second with my amendment, yes.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Secretary?

12 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

14 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

15 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

16 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

17 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

18 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

19 MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

20 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

21 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

23 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

2 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion passes.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

5 Congratulations for the first motion. And go to the
6 second motion for the, Michael Thompson.

7 MEMBER THOMPSON: Okay. I move that we grant
8 the variance in case number PZ23-0024 as sought by
9 Motor City Hot Tubs for a sign variance because the
10 petitioner has shown a practical difficulty including
11 hardship requiring a sign on the basis of any of the
12 following: That -- Section 28-5 to allow the placement
13 of the sign at eight feet from the grade, the minimum
14 is eight and a half feet, a variance of .5 feet. And
15 also -- it's just that one.

16 Okay. The construction of a conforming sign
17 would require the removal or significant alteration of
18 natural features on the property because of the
19 projecting sign. And it fits into the space that it
20 currently is.

21 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

23 MS. KOLB: Mr. Chair, before we have a vote.

1 Can we verify the ordinance section that the variance
2 is from?

3 MEMBER THOMPSON: Would that be -- 28-5,
4 letter E, number 1.

5 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah.

6 MEMBER KRIEGER: 1-A or B?

7 MS. KOLB: B. I think this one is B.

8 MEMBER KRIEGER: You're on B?

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, B.

10 MEMBER KRIEGER: Gotcha.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Just state as stated on the
12 agenda. That takes care of everything.

13 MEMBER THOMPSON: As stated on the agenda.

14 MEMBER SANGHVI: Takes care of everything.

15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you. Call
16 for the roll call.

17 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

19 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

20 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

21 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

22 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

1 MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

2 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

3 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

4 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

5 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

6 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

7 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

8 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion passes.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Congratulations for
10 the second motion.

11 MEMBER THOMPSON: Number three, I grant -- I
12 move that we grant the variance, the variance in case
13 PZ23-0024 sought by Motor City Hot Tubs for a sign
14 variance because the petitioner has shown practical
15 difficulty including hardship requiring a sign variance
16 on the basis of any of the following: That also a
17 height of 14.83 feet from the grade, the maximum
18 allowed height of 12 feet, a variance of 2.83 feet.

19 That the construction of the conforming sign
20 would require the removal or significant alteration of
21 natural features on the property because of the
22 projecting sign that I believe fits into the space it
23 currently is.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Roll call,
please.

MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion passes.

MEMBER LONGO: Member Longo, I also approve.

MS. FLETCHER: Did I skip you?

MEMBER LONGO: Yeah.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah.

MS. FLETCHER: I'm so sorry.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Yeah, go
ahead. You are done?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

MEMBER LONGO: One more time.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

Congratulations on the third motion.

And fourth motion, Mr. Thompson, please proceed on that.

MEMBER THOMPSON: I move that we grant the variance in case PZ23-0024 sought by Motor City Hot Tub for a sign variance because the petitioner has shown practical difficulty, including hardship, requiring a sign variance on the basis of the following: That the property is zoned in Town Center-1, TC-1.

The failure -- that the failure to grant relief will unreasonably prevent or limit the use of the property and will result in substantially more than a mere inconvenience or inability to obtain a higher economic because of the location of the sign is in a good place compared with its local businesses.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Before you move to second, what is the company name?

MR. NAGEL: Image 360.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Image 360. I would like to add, if you fail in Novi city without any permission, they're going to deny in future cases on

1 your business.

2 MR. NAGEL: I'm sorry. Again, fail to.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Before taking a
4 permission.

5 MR. NAGEL: Oh, yes.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Please, make a note
7 on that.

8 MR. NAGEL: Yes, sir.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: So we would like to
10 increase, but we don't want to take your bread and
11 butter, but you need to follow the rules and
12 regulations. Please add on that one.

13 Thank you. Please move to -- somebody can
14 make a second, please.

15 MS. KOLB: Wait. Hang on.

16 MR. HALL: Mr. Chairman, can we add to the
17 motion that it's the variance to the Sign Design Review
18 Manual and it's allowing this sign to be internally
19 lit, which is prohibited.

20 MS. KOLB: And you specify that that's what
21 you're moving to grant the variance for?

22 MR. HALL: That's the variance is to be lit
23 inside.

1 MS. KOLB: Thank you.

2 MEMBER SANGHVI: And may I offer a friendly
3 amendment to this motion and just add that these
4 variances are necessary for business identification?

5 MS. KOLB: That's up to the maker of the
6 motion if he wants to incorporate that.

7 MEMBER SANGHVI: So that --

8 MEMBER THOMPSON: Because it's necessary for
9 business --

10 MEMBER SANGHVI: Identification.

11 MEMBER THOMPSON: -- identification.

12 MS. KOLB: Now we need a second.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Okay. Who
14 can make second?

15 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: You want to make a
17 second, Dr. Sanghvi?

18 MEMBER SANGHVI: I make a second.

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.
20 And call for the --

21 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

23 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

MEMBER KRIEGER: No.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion passes.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

Congratulations, Mr. Robert. Good luck.

MR. DEMPSTER: Thank you very much in getting us out of the hot tub and you're welcome to come to the hot tub one day. Okay? Thank you very much. It was a beautiful night. Thank you.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you so much.

MR. NAGEL: Nice job, Mike.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Good luck.

MEMBER THOMPSON: Thanks, guys.

CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. And today's

1 last case, PZ23-0026, Davide Piccirilli-Hannon Systems
2 USA, LLC, 39600 Lewis Drive, West of Haggerty Road,
3 South of Thirteen Mile, Parcel 50-22-12-200-026. The
4 applicant is requesting a variance from the City of
5 Novi Sign Ordinance Section 28-5(d)d to allow an
6 additional wall sign on the northeast elevation,
7 maximum of two wall signs are allowed for this tenant,
8 a variance of one additional wall sign. This request
9 would increase the total allowed number of signs for
10 this tenant, including entrance ground signs, to five.
11 This property is zoned Office Service Technology, OST.

12 Okay. Please go ahead. Spell your first and
13 last name clearly for our court record and my secretary
14 will take the oath if you're not an attorney.

15 MS. KOESTER: Evelyn Koester. Evelyn,
16 E-v-e-l-y-n. Koester is K-o-e-s-t-e-r. And then --

17 MEMBER LONGO: I'm sorry. Are you an
18 attorney?

19 MS. KOESTER: No.

20 MEMBER LONGO: You promise to tell the truth
21 in this case?

22 MS. KOESTER: Yes.

23 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you,
2 Secretary.

3 Evelyn, anybody would like to join on this
4 case? We have a few or you are the only one before we
5 start the case?

6 MS. KERN: I'm here just in case --

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Please go
8 ahead. Spell your name, first name --

9 MS. KERN: Katie Kern. K-a-t-i-e, K-e-r-n.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Come to the podium
11 near to the mic so that way we can hear everybody.

12 MS. KERN: It's Katie Kern. K-a-t-i-e,
13 K-e-r-n.

14 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney, Katie?

15 MS. KERN: No, I'm not.

16 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell the
17 truth in this case?

18 MS. KERN: Yes.

19 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Be up to the
21 podium, please.

22 MR. SMITH: Yes. Good evening. Steve Smith.
23 Steve, S-t-e-v-e. Smith, S-m-i-t-h.

1 MEMBER LONGO: Are you an attorney?

2 MR. SMITH: No.

3 MEMBER LONGO: Do you promise to tell the
4 truth in this case?

5 MR. SMITH: Yes, I do.

6 MEMBER LONGO: Thank you.

7 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Steve.
8 And the three of you stand at the podium until this
9 case is done. Okay.

10 And please proceed, Evelyn. I appreciate.
11 Go ahead whoever wants to first present. We can help
12 you tonight where we can.

13 MS. KOESTER: Okay. Thank you very much. So
14 we're here today to discuss our request for a variance
15 onto our existing signage. Hannon Systems is located
16 at 39600 Lewis Drive in Novi, which is located on the
17 southwest corner of Haggerty Road and Lewis Drive,
18 between Twelve and Thirteen Mile Road. Wasn't quite
19 sure everyone knew where that was.

20 We are currently expanding our lease space.
21 We'll soon occupy 75 percent of the building. And our
22 building is configured in an L shape which faces both
23 Haggerty Road and Lewis Drive. As a result of this

1 expansion, we expect additional customers, suppliers
2 and guest to be visiting our facility. The building
3 currently has two existing lobby spaces. And without
4 the Hannon Systems sign on the canopy sign, it will be
5 difficult for our guests to know which lobby to enter.
6 To know which entrance is the correct one.

7 As our application indicates, the canopy
8 lettering is not lit, it is not visible from Lewis
9 Drive or Haggerty Road. The sign becomes visible only
10 after entering our parking lot. It sits back a small
11 distance from the parking lot due to our circular
12 drive. And without the canopy lettering, there's no
13 signage on the inset portion of the building to guide
14 our customers into Hannon Systems lobby space or our
15 entrance.

16 At some point we expect the tenant -- the
17 other tenants will occupy the remaining 25 percent of
18 this building and -- but for now, the other lobby
19 entrance is empty and unmanned. To avoid visitors from
20 trying to enter that lobby, we are asking for your
21 approval to allow us to keep our existing canopy sign
22 so that doesn't cause any inconvenience to any of our
23 customers or our guests.

1 Thank you.

2 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

3 Katie, do you want to speak anything?

4 (Document displayed.)

5 MS. KOESTER: I'm going to just --

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Oh, okay. Go
7 ahead.

8 MS. KOESTER: Unfortunately, we didn't have a
9 color copy of this. But you can see the L shape of our
10 building here. We currently have the first and second
11 floor here and we're -- and we've currently expanded to
12 this section here of the first floor.

13 You see Lewis Drive. You see Haggerty Road
14 here. And when you come in, you have to turn off of
15 Haggerty Road onto Lewis and you pull in here and then
16 you come down and around and here is our lobby.

17 We have a circular drive here. Customer
18 parking is here. There's a lobby here and then here is
19 the other new lobby that was built for this section
20 here. But this is our main lobby here.

21 Any questions?

22 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Steve, do
23 you want to speak on anything?

1 MR. SMITH: Sure. Yeah. I can elaborate a
2 little bit more. I mean, we have a current concern on
3 the site. The building is very large. There's over
4 180,000 square feet in this building. We occupy
5 75,000 -- 75 percent of that. Before Hannon has
6 expanded into that space, there is confusion on site
7 currently. People don't know where to go in the
8 building and they park at the other lobby. Have to
9 make a phone call, you know, get to where they're
10 going. It's difficult even with the existing sign
11 that's there to locate the lobby. It's about a hundred
12 yards, 300 feet from the street, from both Haggerty and
13 Lewis Drive. So you cannot see that sign until you get
14 on the property. So we think that's a good reason to
15 have the sign and also, you know, not a big violation
16 of the ordinance having a small non-illuminated sign at
17 the entry to help people get where they're going once
18 they're on site.

19 And I do want to make sure it's clear that,
20 you know, we have submitted for permit for the two
21 illuminated building signs that is currently under
22 permit review right now. And this waiver, this
23 variance is to request keeping the existing

1 non-illuminated smaller sign for the exact reasons that
2 we just discussed.

3 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Steve, can you show
4 me on the picture where the signs are going now?

5 MR. SMITH: Yes, I can.

6 So the existing -- there's an existing sign
7 right here at this corner of the building. This is an
8 exterior illuminated building sign that's going to
9 remain and be replaced with a new illuminated sign of
10 the same size. Just different logo, updated sign.

11 On this corner of the -- this is the east
12 wing facing Haggerty, right where this arrow is
13 pointing. There's a proposed new sign. This is the
14 expansion space, this wing of the building. We're
15 taking over the first floor. So we're getting a permit
16 to install our second ordinance compliant sign on that
17 side of the building facing Haggerty so we have
18 representation on both Haggerty and Lewis Drive that
19 you can see from the street. But it's about a hundred
20 yards away. It's hard to see from Haggerty or Lewis
21 unless we had our illuminated sign.

22 The existing canopy sign is right here where
23 this arrow is pointing. And this is a -- it's about 12

1 foot high canopy. The sign is non-illuminated. It's
2 about two foot high by six foot wide. I can show you a
3 picture of the -- this is the existing sign. This is
4 it during the day. And obviously during the night to
5 show you it's not illuminated. And this is the entry
6 under the canopy that you walk into. So without it,
7 this is what used to exist before the sign was, you
8 know, permitted. The last time we came through, there
9 was no designation on the building and started some of
10 the problems we were talking about. That's one of the
11 reasons why we did come through last time to get the
12 canopy sign permitted. We removed a sign to get that
13 in place because it was an issue.

14 But, again, we're looking for the waiver
15 because we have such a large space and we want to get
16 all three signs on the building for the customers.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.

18 Anybody would like to speak on this?

19 MS. KERN: No. They covered everything.

20 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. From the
21 City, Alan?

22 MR. HALL: Yes. This is an existing building
23 and with two wings in an L shape. And we have no

1 objections to the added signs. We think it does
2 provide more way of finding them on the site and it's
3 more efficient.

4 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.
5 Correspondence, Secretary?

6 MEMBER LONGO: Yes. There were 44 letters
7 mailed out, none returned.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: No objections, no
9 approvals?

10 MEMBER LONGO: None returned.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.
12 Okay. And public hearing, any on the audio
13 or video or anybody? Looks like none.

14 Okay. This looks like it's a huge big
15 building. And you mentioned 180,000 square foot.
16 Yeah. The L shape is -- the building is only single
17 floor, am I right?

18 MS. KOESTER: It's two floors. One side is
19 two floors and the other -- the new addition is one
20 floor.

21 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. That's what.
22 New one.

23 MS. KERN: We'll occupy both.

1 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. New one is a
2 single floor.

3 How many square feet is that one?

4 MR. SMITH: The additional space, the first
5 floor is about 40,000 square feet.

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay.

7 MS. KOESTER: The additional.

8 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: What kind of
9 business is that?

10 MS. KOESTER: We're an automotive supplier.

11 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Automotive
12 supplier.

13 Okay. Thank you so much. I have no
14 objections. And let's open to the board.

15 Please go ahead, Dr. Sanghvi.

16 MEMBER SANGHVI: Thank you. I came and drove
17 around. I also got lost driving around there. It's
18 such a humongous complex. It's just very hard to
19 comprehend by just looking at the pictures how big it
20 is. And you only have a tiny little sign to put it
21 over there. I think you are going to need directional
22 signs inside for people to find where you are located
23 in that complex.

1 MS. KOESTER: Agreed.

2 MEMBER SANGHVI: I have no problem with your
3 request for this little sign for your canopy.

4 MS KOESTER: Thank you.

5 MS. KERN: Thank you.

6 MEMBER SANGHVI: It's much smaller than I
7 would have expected for the size of the complex here.
8 Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you, Dr.
10 Sanghvi.

11 Anybody in the board, please.

12 MEMBER McLEOD: So just a question. In your
13 presentation you mentioned that you guys are taking up
14 roughly 75 percent of the building?

15 MS. KOESTER: Yes.

16 MEMBER McLEOD: According to the diagram we
17 have on screen here, it indicates you're taking a
18 hundred percent of the building so I was a little
19 confused by that.

20 MS. KERN: We're only -- so this side of the
21 building, we're only taking the first floor.

22 MEMBER McLEOD: Oh. So --

23 MS. KERN: Yeah. There's a second level

1 floor --

2 MEMBER McLEOD: I thought you meant there
3 was -- there is a second floor.

4 MS. KERN: Yeah.

5 MEMBER McLEOD: It's just you don't have it.
6 Got it.

7 MS. KERN: Which could be occupied later.
8 Yeah.

9 MEMBER McLEOD: I thought you meant there was
10 only one story available on that half and the other
11 half had two stories. Got you.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.
13 Anybody?

14 Looks like none.

15 I would like to request a motion.

16 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Motion.

17 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah, Clift
18 Montague.

19 MEMBER MONTAGUE: I move that we grant the
20 variance in case number PZ23-0026 for a variance from
21 the City of Novi Sign Ordinance Section 28-5(d) to
22 allow an additional wall sign on the northeast
23 elevation. This will result in five total signs on the

1 site. It's based on the fact that the location of the
2 entrance in relationship to the roads and the parking
3 lot makes it difficult to identify the lobby. The size
4 of the building contributes to that. It is a tough
5 entrance to find.

6 In addition, it really is offset by other
7 improvements. This is way back from the roads and
8 there's an awful lot of landscaping which makes it
9 really hard to see coming up Haggerty and all.

10 MS. KERN: Sure does.

11 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Nice landscaping. So it
12 does have additional assets that offset that.

13 And the relief is consistent with the office
14 park nature of the area.

15 MEMBER SANGHVI: Second.

16 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Thank you.
17 Roll call, please.

18 MS. FLETCHER: Chairperson Peddiboyina?

19 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, please.

20 MS. FLETCHER: Member Krieger?

21 MEMBER KRIEGER: Yes.

22 MS. FLETCHER: Member Longo?

23 MEMBER LONGO: Yes.

1 MS. FLETCHER: Member McLeod?

2 MEMBER McLEOD: Yes.

3 MS. FLETCHER: Member Montague?

4 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Yes.

5 MS. FLETCHER: Member Sanghvi?

6 MEMBER SANGHVI: Yes.

7 MS. FLETCHER: Member Thompson?

8 MEMBER THOMPSON: Yes.

9 MS. FLETCHER: Thank you. Motion passes.

10 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Thank you.

11 Congratulations.

12 MS. KOESTER: Thank you.

13 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. In other
14 matters before I adjourn, yesterday I sent to the mayor
15 and the counsel members, there is an India Independence
16 Day, that it means July 4th, like that. We are
17 celebrating on August 19th at Suburban Showplace. All
18 the board members and the city people, I request you to
19 attend a beautiful parade and food and cultural. I'll
20 be there. I request everybody to attend. And it's a
21 free event. No charge. It's in Suburban Showplace on
22 Saturday, 9:30 a.m.

23 I request you, everybody please join the

1 parade and along with our mayor and city council people
2 and city office. That's all. Thank you.

3 Any other agenda for anybody?

4 MEMBER MONTAGUE: Is that this Saturday?
5 Which Saturday?

6 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Coming Saturday.
7 Yeah, August 19th.

8 MEMBER MONTAGUE: August 19th. Okay.

9 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yes, sir. I'll be
10 there.

11 MEMBER SANGHVI: Make a motion to adjourn.

12 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Yeah. Make a
13 motion to adjourn this today.

14 MEMBER McLEOD: Second.

15 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Okay. Anybody say
16 all in favor "Aye."

17 THE BOARD: Aye.

18 CHAIRPERSON PEDDIBOYINA: Nays. Thank you.

19 (At 8:10 p.m., meeting adjourned.)

20 - - -

21

22

23

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23

C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF MICHIGAN)

) ss

COUNTY OF OAKLAND)

I, Darlene K. May, Notary Public within and for the County of Oakland do hereby certify that I have recorded stenographically the proceedings had and testimony taken in the above-entitled matter at the time and place hereinbefore set forth, and I do further certify that the foregoing transcript, consisting of seventy-five (75) typewritten pages, is a true and correct transcript of my said stenographic notes.

/s/Darlene K. May
Darlene K. May, RMR, CRR, RPR/CSR-6479

August 21, 2023